

Minutes for Lake Rotorua Catchment Stakeholder Advisory Group, 15 July 2014

Rotorua District Council – Council Chambers

1061 Haupapa Street, Rotorua, 9:00 am start

Chair: Tanira Kingi

Present:

- Collective Reps: Stuart Morrison, Neil Heather, Christine Paterson
- LWQS: Don Atkinson, Warren Webber
- RDC: Cr Karen Hunt, Paulina Wilhelm
- TALT: Willie Emery
- Te Arawa land owner Reps: John Fenwick
- Forestry: Colin Maunder
- Small Blocks: Karl Weaver
- BOPRC: Cr Lyall Thurston, plus staff: Warwick Murray, Anna Grayling, Sarah Omundsen, Stephen Lamb and Gemma Moleta
- Others: Simon Park (StAG Secretariat); Gloria Zamora, Gwyn Morgan (Federated Farmers), Ollie Parsons (Dairy NZ), Cr Arapeta Tahana, Graham West (Scion), Phill Thomass, (Rotorua Lakes Community Board), Ben O'Brien (Beef + Lamb NZ)

Action summary

1. Ollie Parsons: update project brief for Catchment Economic Impacts Analysis and circulate prior to subcommittee meeting on 29 July 2014.
2. Ben O'Brien: send Sarah Omundsen allocation scenarios done by Land and Water Partnership
3. StAG subcommittee: ID project milestones for catchment modelling (29 July 2014).
4. Warren Webber: include the feedback from StAG into his forestry analysis and forward to Ollie Parsons for consideration in the catchment model
5. Simon Park: ask BOPRC when N attenuation results will be available for peer review
6. Simon Park: ask John Paterson about reporting to next StAG on catchment phosphorous mitigation work
7. Gloria: Re-send link to Perrin's NDA impacts report

Item 1: Welcome, Karakia and Apologies

Chairman Tanira Kingi welcomed StAG members and attendees to the meeting.

Cr Arapeta Tahana opened with a karakia.

Lateness: Ollie Parsons and Ben O'Brien;

For absence: Cr Neil Oppatt, Joanna Carr, Wendy Roe, Giselle Schweizer, Tamarapa Lloyd, Te Taru White, and Neville Nepia

Motion: Apologies approved. Atkinson/Fenwick, CARRIED
--

Item 2: Minutes of previous meeting (22 May 2014)

Motion: Approved 19 June 2014 Minutes. Webber/Morgan, CARRIED

Item 3: General business items to add

- a) Stuart Morrison: Update on Science Review – to be covered in Agenda Item #4(c)
-

Item 4: Section 32 process for developing new rules

- a) **S32 overview:** Sarah Omundsen outlined the s32 process for developing rules, noting:
- i) Section 32 requirements are set out in Lisa Power's precirculated paper.
 - ii) S32 will be a large piece of work – BOPRC will seek tenders from an expert consultancy firm to lead the analysis – cost of the s32 is from BOPRC's administration budget.
 - The catchment modelling project, led by Dairy NZ, will be a significant component of the s32.
 - Draft s32 needs to be before Council by December 2014.
 - StAG will be asked for input into the s32 process including selection of consultant proposals and the terms of reference at the end of July – agreed StAG representatives are Gwyn Morgan, Ollie Parsons and Hera Naera.
- b) **Forestry Options** - Graham West (Scion) and Warren Webber (LWQS)
- i) Presentation evaluated forestry as a land use opportunity, including "carbon farming" - major differences from farming, notably timing
 - ii) Forestry information exists via consultants, forestry companies and NZ Farm Forestry Association, plus BOPRC expertise:
 - Anyone interested in forestry development on their property may contact the BOPRC and a Land Management Officer will visit and assess the land.
 - iii) Although an additional financial incentive is on offer from NZ Carbon Farming Ltd (expires Sept. 2015) there has been no uptake from Rotorua forest owners.

Action: Warren Webber to include the feedback from StAG into his forestry analysis and forward to Ollie Parsons for consideration in the catchment model

- c) **Catchment Economic Impacts Analysis** - Ollie Parsons
- i) Note pre-circulated draft project plan
 - ii) The catchment can be broadly zoned into three (3) groups – dairy, drystock and commercial forestry – and further sub-groups are needed. A group/sub-group needs to have a defined correlation between profit and N leaching.
 - iii) StAG need to specify what they want from this analysis, noting:
 - It will build on work already done i.e. 9 farms done by GSL in 2010/2011 and recent Perrin Ag work
 - Farmers can maintain profit much easier than revenue as production drops.
 - The analysis can estimate aggregate revenue in the catchment, then apply multipliers to look at downstream impacts

- Input/Outputs modelling will include social impact factors.
 - Estimated cost of the catchment model is \$30k
 - All work done will contribute to Section 32.
- iv) In response to questions:
- TDRs are not included in the in the project scope, difficult to model e.g. predict demand/value.
 - Allocation can be based on just rainfall and soil type (and ignoring sectors) provided it adds up to the 140 tN rules reduction target
 - Include Rotorua's 10 year projected growth in the downstream estimates
- v) Costs and Timeframe
- Start – August and completion by end of November 2014
 - Dairy NZ and BOPRC willing to co-fund with Beef & Lamb contributing.
 - Project Team: Sandra Barns, Ollie Parsons, Gwyn Morgan, Alvaro Romero and Ben O'Brien.

Action: Ollie Parsons: amend project brief for Catchment Economic Impacts Analysis and circulate prior to subcommittee meeting on 29 July 2014.

Action: Ben O'Brien: send Sarah Omundsen allocation scenarios done by Land and Water Partnership.

Action: StAG subcommittee ID project milestones for catchment modelling (29 July 2014).

d) Science Reviews for s32 and 5 year commitment - Simon Park

- i) Recap on considerable science and analysis effort to date e.g. ROTAN, lake modelling, long-term monitoring, Overseer assessments, Farmer Solutions report, Perrin's recent NDA report and AgResearch's interim report on the Parekarangi SFF N fertiliser trials.
- ii) Science around Overseer
 - Acknowledgement that while Overseer is not perfect, it is the best tool available and is fit for regulatory purposes
 - Current discussions with AgResearch on improving local calibration
 - Pending cross-regional council meeting on how to best to use Overseer.
 - Research currently being done on attenuation but the same N actions on farms will achieve the same in-lake reductions as previously predicted.
- iii) 2017 review should be defined soon to give confidence to stakeholders, and be consistent with the Oturoa Agreement. Key discussion points:
 - The review process and specifications could be prescribed as a possible method in the March 2015 plan change
 - A robust 2017 science review is needed and will be peer reviewed.
 - Past predictions on N lake load used best available information
 - Revisiting the 435 tN limit is outside the scope of the current s32 analysis but can be part of the 2017 review flagged in the Oturoa Agreement if new information exists to suggest it needs to be revised.

- A lake phosphorus load (37 tP/y) is part of the 2009 Action Plan, alongside a 10 tP/yr catchment reduction target. At this stage it remains a target BOPRC wants to achieve through non-regulatory action. If new information suggests this P limit will not be met through voluntary action, new P rules and/or resources may be needed.
- iv) Stuart Morrison noted that Collective representatives had recently met with BOPRC Chairman Doug Leeder and Deputy Jane Nees. The objective was to encourage dialogue and hopefully consensus between DairyNZ scientists and the Water Quality TAG, especially in light of the recent improved lake quality.
- v) StAG discussion on the science issues that need to be addressed in 2017 science review (Notes from whiteboard):
- Review of role of P in the lake dynamics,
 - Consider alternate options to meet TLI 4.2 re N and P limits
 - Gain clarity on the sustainability (i.e. environmental risks) of alum dosing given community concern and resource consent expiry
 - Attenuation of N & P losses and spatial targeting (see Norm Ngapo report)
 - More action on P mitigation on land, including efficacy of various mitigations
 - P leaching risk - John MacIntosh review found minimal risk, AgResearch doing further research now
 - Mitigation toolbox e.g. wintering barns/housed systems - LTAG to advise
 - Groundwater trends
 - Land use anomalies (unusual land uses, N losses)
 - Community perception on water quality and the TLI of 4.2 plus related communication (NB: water quality perceptions will not be reviewed until the RPS is reviewed)

Action: Simon Park: Ask Andy Bruere when research on N attenuation will be available for peer review.

Item 5: Farm Nutrient Plan advice, support and costs - Anna Grayling

- a) Support to proceed with Stage 1 & 2 of advice to develop FNPs
- b) Average farm cost estimate \$3000, wide \$ variation which also depends on prior work done e.g. Sustainable Milk Plans, recent Overseer assessments, BOPRC EPs (Environmental Plans)
- c) Landowners may register their interest (with BOPRC staff) in getting advice prior then advisory service commencing September 2014.
- d) Meanwhile BOPRC's land management officers take calls and answer questions.
- e) Next Steps:
 - i) Initial advice procedure goes to RTALSG 25 July 2014 and RDD 12 August 2014.
 - ii) Service will be operational by end of August.
- f) Rationale for some farmers to get a FNP prior to formal rules and official NDAs:
 - i) Some owners understand that risk and want to get a voluntary early start

- ii) Some already have their own version of a “FNP” and have investors lined up to achieve their targets – need to provide a service for these early adopters
- g) If a farmer finds out (through advice) that they are above their 2001-2004 Rule benchmark, they must be advised to comply with likely case-by-case working with BOPRC on how to achieve compliance.

Item 6: Updates

- a) **Funding Entity Establishment** - Stephen Lamb
 - i) Progress being made around the detail of the entity.
 - ii) Stephen put 2 questions to StAG:
 - (1) Does the policy need a social conscience? **No**
 - It could depend on where the social threshold is put e.g. if proposals were otherwise equal, one providing more jobs could be favoured. However, while funds are available and criteria met, both should be funded.
 - (2) Should non-landowner proposals be part of the picture? **Yes**
 - iii) Timeframe: have entity process set by August, established by December 2014.

StAG Recommendation: Supportive ongoing development of entity as outlined today

- b) **Consultation schedule on draft rules** - Sarah Omundsen
 - i) Brochure has been sent out to all rural properties.
 - ii) Fact sheets have been completed, additional brochures available from BOPRC
 - iii) Consultations beginning with:
 - 22 July 7pm Dairy sector meeting at Fish and Game
 - 28 July 7pm Drystock meeting at Ngongotaha hall.
- c) **Land TAG Establishment** - Simon Park
 - i) Andy Bruere will be the convener.
 - ii) Appointment panel is now confirmed: Tanira Kingi, Leilani Ngawhika, Andy Bruere, Simon Stokes and Ants Roberts (Panel Chair).
 - iii) Approval given by Council and RTASLG to proceed.
 - iv) Expressions of Interest will be sent to target scientist list 21 July 2014.
- d) **Overseer Rules StAG Workshop** - Simon Park
 - i) Postponed to take advantage of a cross-council Overseer technical group meeting 21/22 August, including dealing fairly with version changes.

Item 7: General Business

- a) TDR consideration at District Plan Hearings - Paulina Wilhelm:
 - i) Meeting was held last week and the decision rests on Hearing members and is set for the end of August; however, it was very well received.

Meeting Concluded 12:20 pm